

EXHIBIT 2

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

2 WESTERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

3 Case No. CIV-14-665-F

4 -----

5 RICHARD GLOSSIP, et al.,

6 Plaintiffs,

7 vs.

8 RANDY CHANDLER, et al.,

9 Defendants.

10 -----

11
12 REMOTE VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF

13 DR. JOSEPH ANTOGNINI

14 January 28, 2021

15 10:03 a.m. EST

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23 Reported by:

24 Debra Stevens, RPR-CRR

25

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 noxious stimuli. Certainly midazolam has
3 been used as a sole drug to induce
4 anesthesia for a procedure, as I have
5 mentioned in my report.

6 (Reporter interruption.)

7 A. As I mentioned in my report,
8 there are -- I did cite studies where
9 midazolam has been used to induce
10 anesthesia in preparation for endotracheal
11 intubation, which is very stimulating.
12 And that, as I said, is in my report.

13 One of the challenges of using
14 midazolam to maintain anesthesia would be
15 that you need a very large dose to be able
16 to achieve that, so large that nobody has
17 actually attempted to do that for a
18 prolonged surgical procedure.

19 So, if we are talking about a
20 very short procedure, there are studies, I
21 think, that indicate that, that you could
22 use midazolam for painful procedures,
23 otherwise painful procedures. But for
24 prolonged procedures, no, there are no
25 studies in humans where midazolam has been

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 used alone for the purposes I mentioned
3 because of the massive dose that would
4 likely need to be administered.

5 Q. But in humans, to use your
6 words, such a massive dose has not been
7 studied clinically. Correct?

8 A. That is correct, to my
9 knowledge.

10 Q. So, you have no basis in
11 science, in data, to opine that midazolam
12 at any dose would maintain anesthesia.
13 Correct?

14 A. I do not have any -- again,
15 there are no data that I am aware of, any
16 published studies where midazolam has been
17 used by itself for a prolonged surgical
18 procedure. By that I mean for hours and
19 hours. So, that is correct. And that is
20 because the dose that would be required or
21 to even study that would be so large that
22 it wouldn't be ethically or clinically
23 worthwhile to pursue.

24 Q. So you rely upon the Gehrke
25 reference. You mentioned endotracheal

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 good drug to use in the study, even the
3 study of midazolam by itself. If they
4 recognized midazolam by itself was not,
5 adequate, they would have mentioned that,
6 I would think, and they did not. The
7 other --

8 Q. Did they say it was adequate?

9 A. That is my recollection. We can
10 certainly pull up the reference, but that
11 is --

12 Q. We'll look at it.

13 A. That's my recollection of it.

14 As far as the Miyake study is
15 concerned, those patients received an
16 opiate called remifentanil with the
17 induction, and then the remifentanil was
18 discontinued right afterwards. And that
19 is a drug that -- its effects dissipate
20 very, very quickly. After five, ten
21 minutes or so or something like that,
22 maybe shorter, the effects are gone.

23 So, that's one of the reasons
24 why, if you look at how these patients
25 behaved in terms of their

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 electroencephalogram, it's pretty clear
3 that 20, 30 minutes out or more, the
4 remifentanil is gone and that basically
5 these patients are doing okay.

6 Also in the discussion section,
7 as I recall -- we will have to pull it up.
8 In the discussion section of the Miyake
9 study, they talked about essentially a
10 preliminary study, and I believe there
11 they did not use remifentanil. So
12 again -- and they got more or less the
13 same result. So, that leads me to believe
14 and opine that midazolam is sufficient to
15 anesthetize patients for the endotracheal
16 intubation and for the continued placement
17 or presence of that endotracheal tube.

18 Q. In these cases, you said that
19 the actual intubation takes a minute or
20 so. Did you say that? A minute, minute
21 and a half?

22 A. Yes. It can be shorter if it's
23 an easy airway and you are skilled, or it
24 can be a little longer. You know,
25 somewhere around there is my guess.

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 Q. Could be 30 seconds?

3 A. Could be 30 seconds, yes.

4 Q. Then it is just there for
5 however long and then it's removed at some
6 point. Is that fair?

7 A. That is correct, yes.

8 Q. And it could be there, you said,
9 for days?

10 A. If the patient, after surgery,
11 needs to be in an intensive care unit and
12 needs a respirator or ventilator, yes, it
13 could be there for days.

14 Q. So is it your testimony that
15 these patients in the Miyake and Gehrke
16 study had their tubes in for an extended
17 period of time without any other
18 medication but for midazolam?

19 A. Well, for the Miyake study that
20 is correct. They stopped the study
21 basically at 60 minutes. After that they
22 basically continued on with surgery and
23 they gave more anesthetic at that point.
24 I don't recall exactly what they used.
25 For the Gehrke study, I don't recall what

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 infusion. It's just been reported to me.

3 Q. Do you have an opinion as to the
4 effect of potassium chloride on a patient
5 at the 240 milliequivalent dose level?

6 A. That amount of potassium would
7 cause pain in an awake human.

8 Q. What kind of pain?

9 A. It would be painful. I mean,
10 patients can have significant pain from
11 it. I have not done any type of study, of
12 course, in terms of, you know, what level
13 of pain it is, although I know, again,
14 that it can be -- it is reported to be
15 quite painful.

16 Q. What kind of reports are you
17 referencing?

18 A. Well, I am aware of some of the
19 reports that have been provided in the
20 exhibits, as I recall, and just in my
21 general knowledge. Recollection in terms
22 of specific reports, again, I would have
23 to refer to the ones I think that were the
24 exhibits.

25 Q. So at the 10 to 40

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 hyperosmolar solution or blood at that
3 point.

4 Q. Conceptually and in terms of a
5 demonstrative, what happens to those cells
6 is not dissimilar to what happens to the
7 slug that we put salt on. Correct?

8 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
9 form.

10 A. I guess that would be one way
11 you could look at it.

12 Q. What pain can that cause?

13 A. Well, again, I already testified
14 that potassium chloride can cause pain if
15 it is injected into a vein. So --

16 Q. I am trying to understand the
17 pathways of the pain. So you identified
18 two. If the cells which the potassium
19 chloride solution come in contact with act
20 like the slug on which we put salt, how
21 does that cause pain?

22 A. The nerve fibers would --
23 sensitive to that, I guess, in that area,
24 they would be activated.

25 Q. And that would result in what

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 kind of pain?

3 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
4 form.

5 Q. How would you characterize that
6 kind of pain? Where would it be felt?

7 A. Well, the clinical descriptions
8 from patients are that it is a burning
9 pain, and basically that's how it is often
10 described.

11 Q. And so a 400 milliequivalent
12 potassium chloride solution in two
13 syringes could in essence cause the
14 melting of the tissue in which it comes in
15 contact with. Correct?

16 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
17 form.

18 A. First off, I believe you said
19 400. I am not sure you meant 400.
20 Perhaps you meant 240.

21 Q. I meant 240. I apologize. 240
22 milliequivalents. Yes.

23 A. I think "melting" is a bit of a
24 pejorative term. I wouldn't say it is
25 equivalent to melting.

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 withdrawal can be present during general
3 anesthesia.

4 Q. If we go back to the chart, do
5 you remember I asked you at the beginning
6 if there were any studies you are aware of
7 where midazolam was used as the only drug
8 to induce and maintain anesthesia to a
9 noxious stimuli and we identified, I
10 think, three different kinds of
11 procedures? One was endotracheal
12 intubation, one was cystoscopy and one was
13 colon -- why am I having trouble with
14 that? What was the third one?

15 A. Colonoscopy.

16 Q. Colonoscopy. I should know
17 that.

18 With respect to the colonoscopy,
19 you can do that without anesthesia I think
20 we established. Correct?

21 A. In some patients because they
22 seem to tolerate it, but many patients
23 don't.

24 Q. So is midazolam the most common,
25 if you are using something for anesthesia,

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 is midazolam the most common choice for
3 colonoscopies?

4 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
5 form.

6 A. I don't know what the most
7 common drugs are used. If you were to say
8 basically what percentage of colonoscopies
9 are done with midazolam, what percentage
10 with other drugs, I don't know the
11 details. All I can tell you, just the
12 total number of patients, not a
13 percentage, a lot of them are done with
14 midazolam and often with other drugs. But
15 they can, based on these reports, be done
16 on midazolam alone.

17 Q. Have you ever done a colonoscopy
18 with midazolam alone?

19 A. I have not.

20 Q. How many colonoscopies have you
21 been the anesthesiologist on?

22 A. My guess would be a small
23 number. It is not something that we
24 normally would be doing in the operating
25 room. Occasionally we might be going up

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 to the endoscopy unit to do it but it is
3 few and far between.

4 Q. In terms of the level or depth
5 of sedation on this continuum, the
6 individuals who, in the study that you
7 rely upon, you say got midazolam only for
8 a colonoscopy, what level of sedation were
9 they at?

10 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
11 form.

12 A. We seem to have a bit of an
13 internet problem here and you broke up.
14 Can you repeat the question?

15 Q. Sure. And I apologize for that.

16 A. Probably not your fault.

17 Q. For the individuals who had
18 midazolam only for anesthesia for their
19 colonoscopy, what depth of sedation on
20 this continuum were they at?

21 A. I do not recall. I have to
22 review the study to know exactly where
23 they had those patients at. I just don't
24 recall.

25 Q. Do you have any reason to think

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 they were under general anesthesia?

3 A. I'd have to look at the study to
4 see what level they got these patients to.
5 I just don't know off the top of my head.

6 Q. Okay. With respect to the
7 cystoscopy procedure, I think you said
8 that is often done with local anesthesia.
9 But in cases where midazolam was used, was
10 midazolam used with local anesthesia or
11 was it used alone without local
12 anesthesia?

13 A. Well, in the study, at least one
14 of the studies that I cited, they had
15 different groups and one of the groups had
16 midazolam alone.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. Actually, I think it was two.
19 Two of the four groups had midazolam
20 alone. That is my recollection.

21 Q. And at what level of anesthesia
22 in this continuum were those patients?

23 A. Well, again, I would have to
24 review the study, to look at it to make
25 sure I have got my studies in my mind

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 were also given muscle relaxants so they
3 could not observe for any type of
4 movement. But nonetheless, the responses
5 of these patients hemodynamically were
6 very similar across different types of
7 drugs.

8 Q. And what techniques were used to
9 evaluate those responses?

10 A. Heart rate and blood pressure.

11 Q. Have you used midazolam alone to
12 do an endotracheal intubation?

13 A. My recollection is that I have.
14 It was a long, long time ago and, I'm
15 sorry, I just don't know -- is it possible
16 that I could have also given an opiate?
17 Yes, it is. I don't recall specifically.

18 Q. How many endotracheal
19 intubations have you participated in?

20 A. Thousands. I have probably done
21 over 10,000 anesthetics in my career, and
22 the vast majority of those involved
23 endotracheal intubation. So, probably
24 talking about 6,000 maybe. It is hard to
25 put a number on it.

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 Q. So you remember on one instance
3 using midazolam for an endotracheal
4 intubation, but you are not sure whether
5 or not you also used an opioid. Is that
6 fair?

7 A. Yes. So, this would have been
8 early in my career, when midazolam was
9 just coming out for use and was being used
10 as an induction drug. So, that is why I
11 recall that I would have used it. We
12 often remember, when new things come out,
13 our experience from them. So, that is why
14 I remember with midazolam, I remember with
15 propofol and so forth. That's the basis
16 for that.

17 Q. Have you ever used midazolam
18 alone as the sole drug in connection with
19 a cystoscopy?

20 A. No, I do not recall using it
21 alone for cystoscopy.

22 Q. How many cystoscopies have you
23 done?

24 A. Just to be technically correct,
25 I have done none. I have done anesthesia

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 for them but I have not done them myself.
3 But anesthesia for them, for cystoscopies,
4 maybe hundreds. Again, it is one of those
5 things that it is hard to put a number on.
6 I have done a lot.

7 Q. Have you ever -- I have asked
8 you about these three procedures. Have
9 you ever used midazolam alone as a drug to
10 induce and maintain general anesthesia?

11 A. I have used it, as I said, for
12 induction. The maintenance part is one
13 that would potentially require a large
14 dose of a drug. To the extent that you'd
15 have to give so much that the -- it would
16 take a long time for a patient to wake up,
17 that is just based on the nature of that
18 drug. And so it would not be wise to try
19 to maintain anesthesia with midazolam
20 alone based on the fact that patients
21 would take a long time to wake up.

22 That is an important reason why
23 it is not done and an important reason
24 why, in the anesthesiology field, people
25 do not venture to try to use it as a drug

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 dosages that are one-tenth of the protocol
3 for Oklahoma on a patient that had not
4 been intubated?

5 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
6 form.

7 A. So, have I used it, even at a
8 tenth of a dose, on a patient that has not
9 been intubated? Do you mean that I have
10 used it and not intubated them afterwards?

11 Q. Correct.

12 A. No.

13 Q. So in connection with vecuronium
14 bromide, you always intubate the patient.
15 Correct?

16 A. If you are giving vecuronium
17 bromide, you either have -- either the
18 patient is already intubated or you are
19 going to intubate them. But you wouldn't
20 give that and then walk away.

21 Q. And what would the sensation be
22 of the patient who received vecuronium
23 bromide and wasn't intubated in connection
24 with it? What would they experience?

25 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 form.

3 A. This is an awake patient?

4 Q. A patient that was not under
5 general anesthesia. What would they
6 experience?

7 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
8 form.

9 A. Well, again, I have to -- you
10 know, not under general anesthesia or
11 sedated or awake, it does make a
12 difference. If you have somebody who is
13 awake, then they will have the sense of
14 losing the muscle function and they will
15 be unable to move and then unable to
16 breathe and then they will die.

17 Q. Okay. And they will experience
18 air hunger and suffocation along the way.
19 Correct?

20 A. If they are awake, yes.

21 Q. And how long would it take such
22 a person to die as a result of
23 suffocation?

24 A. I don't know. That is going to
25 vary from one individual to the next

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 because it basically requires them to
3 decrease their oxygen levels in their
4 blood to the point at which they will
5 become unconscious from the hypoxia. They
6 would live for a little bit longer after
7 that.

8 Q. So from the time that they are
9 paralyzed to the time they become
10 unconscious from the hypoxia, how long
11 would that be, about?

12 A. We are talking about several
13 minutes. I can't really put a number on
14 it. It is going to depend on the
15 individual patient.

16 Q. And it is your opinion that that
17 noxious stimuli is a lesser noxious
18 stimuli than surgical noxious stimuli?

19 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
20 form.

21 A. The -- it is a little bit --
22 what is the word I want to use? Not a
23 good comparison to say what is -- or to
24 opine what are the effects of these drugs
25 in the awake individual with no drug

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 may be a ceiling effect on the pain level
3 here, so just going up a little bit more
4 or faster may not increase the pain very
5 much --

6 Q. Is that speculation, or do you
7 have some study to --

8 MR. MANSINGHANI: Dr. Antognini,
9 you froze for a bit. If you can
10 remember, you may need to repeat the
11 last couple sentences of what you
12 said.

13 THE WITNESS: Potassium chloride
14 is painful, but whether it is
15 supramaximal or not, we just don't
16 have a lot of evidence either way.
17 You know, you might claim it is
18 supramaximal, incredibly painful, and
19 I am not sure that there is any good
20 evidence out there to support that
21 because, again, we are talking
22 about -- you give the potassium
23 chloride faster; does the pain go up?
24 It may go up, but basically even at
25 that level is it a supramaximal amount

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 of pain? I don't know the answer to
3 that question.

4 For obvious reasons, you can --
5 I mean, if you did that, you would
6 kill a patient because of the
7 potassium overdose.

8 Q. Right. But we do know, at
9 least, that clinically, if you push it,
10 even at the lower amounts that are
11 one-tenth of this protocol, if you push it
12 fast, that it does in many cases cause
13 severe pain. Correct?

14 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
15 form.

16 A. Patients have reported
17 significant pain with -- some patients
18 have reported significant pain with
19 potassium chloride infusion.

20 Q. I think you said we don't know
21 or you don't know how much more pain is
22 caused by the fact that we are
23 administering ten times as much as usually
24 is over a much shorter period of time; you
25 just don't know how much more pain is

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 caused. Correct?

3 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to the
4 form and to the extent it
5 mischaracterizes prior testimony.

6 A. I am not sure that anybody knows
7 because, again, that type of
8 administration would kill people, as we
9 know. So, you are not going to find a lot
10 of information out there.

11 Q. Do you have any basis to believe
12 that there is a ceiling effect in terms of
13 the pain levels for clinical
14 administration of potassium chloride as
15 compared to 240 milliequivalents pushed
16 quickly?

17 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
18 form.

19 A. I do not know of any clinical
20 studies that would make that comparison,
21 again for the same reasons I talked about.
22 But it's possible that potassium chloride
23 at that level, although causing pain
24 initially, will cause enough effects on
25 the cells and the nerve fibers that they

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 are no longer able to discharge and
3 therefore actually not function properly.

4 Q. Well, we know it is going to
5 polarize the neurons that are part of the
6 nociceptor pathway in the blood vessels.
7 Correct?

8 A. Initially, that is true. But
9 if -- and I can speculate. I mean, that
10 is all I am doing at this point basically
11 because I don't know that anyone studied
12 that.

13 Q. So you are speculating that at
14 some point in time the pain system stops
15 working because of the excessive amount of
16 potassium chloride. How long are you
17 speculating that may take?

18 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to form
19 and to the extent it mischaracterizes
20 prior testimony.

21 A. I admit what I am saying is some
22 speculation. And I can't speculate any
23 more because the nature of speculation is
24 I don't have -- I am basing that opinion,
25 speculative opinion, on my knowledge of

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 the effect of fluids and things like
3 potassium chloride, how they have effects
4 on neurons in terms of depolarizing them.
5 Once they are depolarized, they may not
6 work properly afterwards. Nerve fibers, I
7 should say. But I am not aware of any
8 data at this point that would support that
9 speculation.

10 Q. So you have no scientific basis
11 to support that speculation; and even if
12 it were to take place at some point, you
13 have no basis to support the speculation
14 that it would take place before the
15 prisoner died of a heart attack. Correct?

16 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
17 form.

18 A. I do not know that, what the
19 time frame would be relative to the
20 cardiac arrest. All I can say is that
21 from the moment that the potassium
22 chloride is injected to the moment that
23 the inmate has a cardiac arrest is going
24 to probably be on the order of maybe
25 10 seconds or so.

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 Q. So it might be 10 seconds of
3 severe pain?

4 A. Potentially. If -- and I
5 don't -- I should say I dispute that a
6 prisoner in this setting would experience
7 pain. What I am saying is that the period
8 of the stimulation from the potassium
9 chloride would be maybe 8 to 10 seconds
10 before there is cardiac arrest.

11 And I do not -- and I believe
12 that the inmate is not having pain because
13 of that because of the midazolam.
14 Midazolam, in my opinion, causes
15 sufficient depression of the brain so that
16 the inmate would not experience pain in
17 the way that an awake individual would
18 experience pain from the injection of the
19 potassium chloride.

20 Q. But the adequacy of the
21 anesthesia or the general anesthesia and
22 the drugs used will correlate to the
23 extent to which the stimuli are noxious.
24 Right?

25 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to

1 DR. J. ANTOGNINI

2 administered a paralytic. That is the
3 succinylcholine. Correct?

4 A. Yes. They were given
5 succinylcholine. It must be on the next
6 page where they talk about giving
7 succinylcholine. Yes.

8 Q. There were no consciousness
9 checks able to be done on these patients
10 by virtue of the fact that they were
11 paralyzed. Correct?

12 A. That is correct. You are not
13 able to do a consciousness check after
14 paralysis. But my point about this paper
15 was it was a comparison between the two
16 drugs, thiopental and midazolam. He
17 achieved clinically adequate induction
18 with no difference in the cardiovascular
19 response.

20 Q. How soon after did they
21 administer the additional drugs?

22 MR. MANSINGHANI: Object to
23 form.

24 A. Additional drugs? You mean --

25 Q. It is highlighted here,